

402(2): Derivation of the force equation from the Lagrangian

No - Relativistic

The Lagrangian is:

$$L = T - V = \frac{1}{2} m \dot{\underline{r}} \cdot \dot{\underline{r}} + \frac{nMG}{r} \quad (1)$$

Consider the formal Euler Lagrange equation:

$$\frac{\partial L}{\partial \underline{r}} = \frac{d}{dt} \frac{\partial L}{\partial \dot{\underline{r}}} = \underline{dp} \quad (2)$$

in which $\underline{p} = \frac{\partial L}{\partial \dot{\underline{r}}}$ - (3)

from the fundamentals of the Hamilton and Lagrange dynamics. It is clear that eq. (3) follows from the formal differentiation of L w.r.t. $\dot{\underline{r}}$, i.e.

$$\frac{d}{dt} \underline{r} \cdot \underline{r} = 2 \dot{\underline{r}} \quad (4)$$

Therefore eq. (2) is the Newton orbital equation:

$$\underline{F} = \frac{dp}{dt} = -nMG \frac{\underline{r}}{r^3} \quad (5)$$

Q.E.D.

The formal equation (2) is defined in vector algebra as:

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\partial L}{\partial x} \underline{i} + \frac{\partial L}{\partial y} \underline{j} &= \frac{d}{dt} \left(\frac{\partial L}{\partial \dot{x}} \underline{i} + \frac{\partial L}{\partial \dot{y}} \underline{j} \right) - (6) \\ &= m (\ddot{x} \underline{i} + \ddot{y} \underline{j}) \end{aligned}$$

This definition gives rigorously self consistent results.

as follows:

$$\frac{\partial \mathcal{L}}{\partial x} = \frac{d}{dt} \frac{\partial \mathcal{L}}{\partial \dot{x}} = m \ddot{x} \quad - (7)$$

$$\frac{\partial \mathcal{L}}{\partial y} = \frac{d}{dt} \frac{\partial \mathcal{L}}{\partial \dot{y}} = m \ddot{y} \quad - (8)$$

The Lagrangian (1) is:

$$\mathcal{L} = \frac{1}{2} m (\dot{x}^2 + \dot{y}^2) + \frac{mMg}{(x^2 + y^2)^{1/2}} \quad - (9)$$

From eqs. (7) to (9):

$$F_x = m \ddot{x} = -mMg \frac{x}{(x^2 + y^2)^{3/2}} \quad - (10)$$

$$F_y = m \ddot{y} = -mMg \frac{y}{(x^2 + y^2)^{3/2}} \quad - (11)$$

So

$$\underline{F} = F_x \underline{i} + F_y \underline{j} = -mMg \frac{(x \underline{i} + y \underline{j})}{(x^2 + y^2)^{3/2}} \quad - (12)$$

$$= \frac{dp}{dt} = -mMg \frac{\underline{r}}{r^3}$$

Q.E.D. Eqs. (2) and (6) give the same result.

Relativistic

The relativistic Lagrangian is:

$$\mathcal{L} = -\frac{mc^2}{\gamma} + \frac{mMg}{r} \quad - (13)$$

$$= -mc^2 \left(1 - \frac{\underline{v} \cdot \underline{v}}{c^2} \right)^{1/2} + \frac{mMg}{|\underline{r}|}$$

3) Using the formal equation (2) then:

$$\underline{F} = m \frac{d\underline{\dot{r}}}{dt} = m \frac{d}{dt} (\gamma \underline{\dot{r}})$$

$$= \gamma^3 m \underline{\ddot{r}} = -mMg \frac{\underline{r}}{r^3} \quad (14)$$

which is the relativistic force equation Q.E.D.

The Lagrangian (13) is:

$$L = -mc^2 \left(1 - \frac{\dot{x}^2 + \dot{y}^2}{c^2} \right)^{1/2} + \frac{mMg}{(x^2 + y^2)^{1/2}} \quad (15)$$

The formal equation (2) becomes eq. (5), so:

$$F_x = m \frac{d}{dt} (\gamma \dot{x}) = -mMg \frac{x}{(x^2 + y^2)^{3/2}} \quad (16)$$

$$F_y = m \frac{d}{dt} (\gamma \dot{y}) = -mMg \frac{y}{(x^2 + y^2)^{3/2}} \quad (17)$$

i.e.
$$\gamma^3 \ddot{x} = -Mg \frac{x}{(x^2 + y^2)^{3/2}} \quad (18)$$

$$\gamma^3 \ddot{y} = -Mg \frac{y}{(x^2 + y^2)^{3/2}} \quad (19)$$

which are the equations used in UFTBTT Q.E.D.

Eqs. (16) and (17) are eqs. (14) in component form, Q.E.D. Therefore the theory is self-consistent.

IL summary:

The classical force equation is:

$$\underline{F} = m \underline{\ddot{r}} = -\frac{nM\mu}{r^3} \underline{r} \quad (20)$$

The relativistic force equation is:

$$\underline{F} = \gamma^3 m \underline{\ddot{r}} = -\frac{nM\mu}{r^3} \underline{r} \quad (21)$$

in which:

$$\gamma = \left(1 - \frac{\dot{\underline{r}} \cdot \dot{\underline{r}}}{c^2}\right)^{-1/2} \quad (22)$$

Eq. (21) gives orbital precession, eq. (20) does not.

Plane Polar Analysis

Eqs. (20) to (22) are true in any coordinate system. For plane polars:

$$\underline{r} = r \underline{e}_r \quad (23)$$

$$\dot{\underline{r}} = \dot{r} \underline{e}_r + r \dot{\phi} \underline{e}_\phi \quad (24)$$

$$\ddot{\underline{r}} = (\ddot{r} - r \dot{\phi}^2) \underline{e}_r + (r \ddot{\phi} + 2\dot{r} \dot{\phi}) \underline{e}_\phi \quad (25)$$

Therefore in plane polars, eq. (20) gives:

$$\ddot{r} - r \dot{\phi}^2 = -\frac{nM\mu}{r^2} \quad (26)$$

$$r \ddot{\phi} + 2\dot{r} \dot{\phi} = 0 \quad (27)$$

and eq. (21) gives:

$$\gamma^3 (\ddot{r} - r \dot{\phi}^2) = -\frac{nM\mu}{r^2} \quad (28)$$

$$r \ddot{\phi} + 2\dot{r} \dot{\phi} = 0 \quad (29)$$

in which:

$$5) \quad V = \left(1 - \frac{\dot{r}^2 + r^2 \dot{\phi}^2}{c^2} \right)^{-1/2} \quad - (30)$$

Numerical integration of eqs. (26) and (27), regarded as simultaneous equations, must produce the orbit

$$r = \frac{a}{1 + \epsilon \cos \phi} \quad - (31)$$

i.e. a conic section. Once this is demonstrated, numerical integration of the simultaneous equations (28) and (29) produces a precessing orbit (4π to 3π).

Lagrangian in plane polars

This is described in Meria and Thornton, chapter 7 for classical dynamics. In this case:

$$\mathcal{L} = T - U = \frac{1}{2} m (\dot{r}^2 + r^2 \dot{\phi}^2) + \frac{nm\hbar}{r} \quad - (32)$$

wf

$$\frac{d\mathcal{L}}{dr} = \frac{d}{dt} \left(\frac{\partial \mathcal{L}}{\partial \dot{r}} \right) \quad - (33)$$

$$\frac{d\mathcal{L}}{d\phi} = \frac{d}{dt} \left(\frac{\partial \mathcal{L}}{\partial \dot{\phi}} \right) \quad - (34)$$

Eq. (34)

$$\text{produces } L = m r^2 \dot{\phi} \quad - (35)$$

$$\frac{dL}{dt} = 0 \quad - (36)$$

conserved angular momentum:

Eq. (33) gives $\frac{d}{dt}$ (26).

Eq. (27) or (29) are missing, and must be given by transforming eq. (6) to plane polars.

The conserved angular momentum is:

$$\underline{L} = \underline{r} \times \underline{p} \quad - (37)$$

$$\frac{d\underline{L}}{dt} = \underline{0} \quad - (38)$$

and can be expressed in terms of Cartesian coordinates:

$$\underline{L} = m (\dot{x}\dot{y} - \dot{y}\dot{x}) \underline{k} \quad - (39)$$

$$\frac{d\underline{L}}{dt} = 0 \quad - (40)$$

So:

$$\frac{d\underline{L}}{dt} = m (\dot{x}\ddot{y} + x\ddot{y} - (\dot{y}\ddot{x} + x\ddot{y})) \underline{k} = 0 \quad - (41)$$

Q.E.D.

The relativistic Lagrangian in plane polaris is:

$$\mathcal{L} = -mc^2 \left(1 - \frac{\dot{r}^2 + r^2 \dot{\phi}^2}{c^2} \right)^{1/2} + \frac{nMGr}{r} \quad - (42)$$

So the relativistic angular momentum is conserved in the Lagrangian (42) used in eq. (34):

$$L = \gamma m r^2 \dot{\phi} \quad - (43)$$

$$\frac{dL}{dt} = 0 \quad - (44)$$

Q.E.D.

Eqs. (33) and (42) give:

$$F = m \frac{d}{dt} (\gamma \dot{r}) = - \frac{nMGr}{r^2} \quad - (45)$$

$$F = \gamma^3 m \ddot{r} = - \frac{nMGr}{r^2} \quad - (46)$$

Q.E.D. Eq. (46) gives orbital precession w/o conservation of relativistic angular momentum.